

# The *Pramāṇasamuccaya*'s Opening Reverence Invocation and Kamalaśīla's *Bodhicitta*

SATŌ Chigaku

## 1. Introduction

In the opening reverence invocation of *Pramāṇasamuccaya* (PS), to describe the Buddha Dignāga uses four names expressing meritorious qualities, including *jagaddhitaṣin* (one who wishes for the benefit of the people of the world).

As noted by scholars, Dharmakīrti's *Pramāṇavārttika* II (PV II) takes the form of a commentary on PS's opening reverence invocation.<sup>1)</sup>

Eltschinger 2011 also discusses the relationship between *jagaddhitaṣin* in this invocation and *bodhicittotpāda* in PV II. However, that study does not take into account how the two types of *bodhicitta* discussed by Kamalaśīla in *First Bhāvanākrama* (BhK I) are related.

In this paper, I will examine the relationship of the PS opening reverence invocation's *jagaddhitaṣin* and *śāstr* with the two types of *bodhicitta* discussed in BhK I.

## 2. *Jagaddhitaṣin* and *Bodhicitta*

The below appears in Kamalaśīla's BhK I.

BhK I, 190.14–16: By him (the bodhisattva) vowing, based on the above cultivation of compassion, to save all sentient beings, *bodhicitta* characterized by the seeking of peerless correct perfect enlightenment arises without effort [in the bodhisattva].

A similar passage is found in Jinendrabuddhi's *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā* (PST). The below is about the *jagaddhitaṣin*.

PST, 9.4–6: [Dignāga] presents intention [*āśaya*] as follows: “As for *āśaya*, it is one who wishes for the benefit of the people of the world.” Furthermore that (being one who wishes for the benefit of the people of the world) is characterized by seeking [the following:] all people of the

world ultimately escaping suffering[. It] is compassion that becomes embodied by cultivation over a very long kalpa.

“Seeking all people of the world ultimately escaping suffering” and the assertion that this is based on the cultivation of compassion appears to correspond to the previously-quoted BhK I passage.<sup>2)</sup>

### 3. Kamalaśīla’s Two Types of *Bodhicitta*

Existing scholarship holds that BhK I’s below categorization of *bodhicitta* follows the two types presented by Śāntideva.<sup>3)</sup>

BhK I, 192.17–193.5: And that *bodhicitta* of the two kinds is the vowing mind (*praṇidhicitta*) and the initiating mind (*prasthānacitta*) . . . (1) First, the mind that is characterized by initially seeking to become a buddha to benefit the entire world—that is the vowing mind. (2) If anyone [a bodhisattva] is seen who is going into action [to acquire] the provisions (*saṃbhāreṣu*) by observing the restraints from whence a certain thing[, i.e., the mind, arises],<sup>4)</sup> then that is the initiating mind.

Here, Kamalaśīla categorizes *bodhicitta* into the vowing mind and the initiating mind.<sup>5)</sup> The previously-quoted BhK I (190.14–16) is entirely about the vowing mind.

Also, as the above passage states, the initiating mind is the mind when a bodhisattva is, in order to become a buddha, pressing ahead to acquire the provisions after accepting and embracing the restraints.

Regarding the acquisition of “provisions,” BhK I (187.14–188.1) states that to help others, bodhisattvas press ahead with the acquisition of these provisions, which is difficult and spans a long time, and then completely acquire them, thereby becoming omniscient (a buddha). The initiating mind is the mind that arises when these bodhisattvas press ahead to acquire these provisions.

With that said, as discussed in Satō 2012, BhK I does not include any explanation regarding these “provisions” in its discussion of the initiating mind. That study examines this issue and show that in the *Pāramitāyānabhāvanākramopadeśa*, a text by Jñānakīrti (9th c.?)<sup>6)</sup> these provisions for which bodhisattvas work refer to the ten perfections (for example, giving) and other practices.<sup>7)</sup> It appears that in BhK I as well, these provisions refer to the ten perfections and other practices.

BhK I (193.15–194.8) also provides an overview of practices necessary for bodhisattvas to acquire *bodhi* (to become a buddha). In the same place, the ten perfections and other practices are presented as bodhisattva practices.

The previously-quoted BhK I (187.14–188.1) stated that one becomes omniscient (a buddha) by working to acquire provisions over a long period and completely acquiring them. It also says that this is done to help others. BhK I (193.15–194.8) presented the likes of the ten perfections as bodhisattva practices necessary for benefiting sentient beings by becoming a buddha. Therefore, it appears that the “provisions” that bodhisattvas work to acquire in order to help others are bodhisattva practices such as the ten provisions.

#### 4. *Śāstr* and the Initiating Mind

PST (12.1–11) discusses the *śāstr*. It states that one who has spent a long time to acquire compassion, namely, a *jagaddhitaṣin*, will then engage in cultivation for long periods. Here, this long cultivation is carried out by a bodhisattva. In other words, PST states that bodhisattvas, who are focused on benefiting others, cultivate the perception of no-self in various ways over a long time in order to become a buddha and teach others.

This appears to match BhK I (187.14–188.1). In other words, we could say that the mind that arises at the starting point as a *śāstr* (or, at the end of being a *jagaddhitaṣin*), when bodhisattvas begin to cultivate the perception of no-self in various ways, is the initiating mind. Jinendrabuddhi, who was active a little earlier than Kamalaśīla, may have known about Śāntideva’s two types of *bodhicitta*.

#### 5. What about Dharmakīrti and Devendrabuddhi?

In PV II, 34ab, Dharmakīrti states that the means for establishing (*sādhana*) that the Buddha is the *pramāṇa* is compassion realized by cultivation.<sup>9)</sup> Devendrabuddhi explains this compassion realized via cultivation as follows:

PVP D16a3–4, P 18a1–2: Compassion, that *sādhana* of *pramāṇa*, is that which has no loathing and is characterized by wishing, without expecting anything in return, that all sentient beings equally and completely escape suffering—that is the *sādhana*.

The above appears to be the same understanding as found in the previously-quoted PST

(9.4–6).

In his commentary on PV II, 136 (PVP, D 56b6–57a1; P 64b5–64b7), Devendrabuddhi explains that bodhisattvas cultivate the perception of no-self over a long time.<sup>10)</sup> This cultivation for others is done by bodhisattvas to become a buddha and teach others, in other words, to benefit sentient beings.<sup>11)</sup>

Devendrabuddhi, as well as probably Dharmakīrti, hold that a *jagaddhitaṣin* is one (a bodhisattva) who, by cultivating compassion, has acquired this compassion, namely, the wish for all sentient beings to escape suffering, and that this individual, as a *śāstr*, cultivates the perception of no-self in numerous and diverse ways over a long period in order to become a buddha and teach others.<sup>12)</sup>

Therefore, like Jinendrabuddhi, both Dharmakīrti and Devendrabuddhi may have thought that the mental state of a bodhisattva *jagaddhitaṣin* is the vowing mind and that the mind of the bodhisattva when they begin cultivation as a *śāstr* (or, at the end of being a *jagaddhitaṣin*) is the initiating mind.

## 6. Conclusion

Devendrabuddhi and Jinendrabuddhi, as well as probably Dharmakīrti, understood a *jagaddhitaṣin* to be a bodhisattva that has realized compassion, namely, the wish that all sentient beings escape suffering. The psychological state of such a bodhisattva appears to correspond to the “vowing mind” that Kamalaśīla spoke of in his above discussion of *bodhicitta*.

Also, I see the “the initiating mind” as expressing the mind of bodhisattvas who are beginning to engage in cultivation as a *śāstr* (their last mind as a *jagaddhitaṣin*) for the benefit of sentient beings, that is, for becoming a buddha and teaching.

Also, Kamalaśīla held that the two types of *bodhicitta* are sequential: the vowing mind arises, and then it is followed by the initiating mind. This is similar to the structure of the *jagaddhitaṣin* being followed by the *śāstr*.

However, Dharmakīrti, Devendrabuddhi, and Jinendrabuddhi did not use the terms “vowing mind” and “initiating mind.” While there are certainly points of correspondence between *jagaddhitaṣin*- and *śāstr*-related passages and those related to these two minds, it is unclear whether they were aware of these two concepts when writing the texts covered in this paper.

In order to make clear the views regarding *bodhicitta* and cultivation of not only Dharmakīrti and his successors but also Śāntideva and those that preceded him, further research is necessary that engages in a wider-ranging analysis of materials regarding the *bodhicitta* that Dharmakīrti, Devendrabuddhi, Jinendrabuddhi, and others had in mind.

---

I would like to thank Dr. Shinya Moriyama for his valuable advice following my presentation.

#### Notes

- 1) Cf. Eltschinger 2011, 43, fn.2.
- 2) According to PST, the *jagaddhitaṣṭin* can also be a state of bodhisattvas. Cf. PST, 16.7-8.
- 3) Cf. Satō 2012, 93, fn.11.
- 4) – *grahaṇena*] em.
- 5) Outside of BhK I, Kamalaśīla uses other categorization methods, but I will not cover them in this paper.
- 6) See Satō 2012, 96-97.
- 7) See Satō 2012, 104-106.
- 8) Cf. PST, 16.7-8.
- 9) Cf. Eltschinger 2011, 65.
- 10) Cf. Eltschinger 2011, 68.
- 11) Cf. PV II, 137-138ab.
- 12) Cf. Eltschinger 2011, 69.

#### Abbreviations

- PV II:** *Pramāṇavārttika*, Chapter II. See Vetter 1984.
- PVP:** *Pramāṇavārttikapañjikā*. D no. 4217; P no. 5717.
- PST:** *Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā. Jinendrabuddhi's Viśālāmalavatī Pramāṇasamuccayaṭīkā, Chapter I*. Ed. Ernst Steinkellner, Helmut Krasser, and Horst Lasic. Beijing: China Tibetology Publishing House; Vienna: Austrian Academy of Sciences Press, 2005.
- BhK I:** *First Bhāvanākrama. Minor Buddhist Texts*. Part II, *First Bhāvanākrama of Kamalaśīla: Sanskrit and Tibetan Texts with Introduction and English Summary*. Ed. Giuseppe Tucci. Serie Orientale Roma IX, 2. Rome: Is. M. E. O., 1958.

#### Bibliography

- Eltchinger, Vincent.** 2011. "Studies on Dharmakīrti's religious philosophy (3): Compassion and its role in the general structural of PV 2." In *Religious and Logic in Buddhist Philosophical Analysis: Proceedings of the Fourth International Dharmakīrti Conference Vienna, August 23-27, 2005*, ed. Helmut Krasser, Horst Lasic, Eli Franco, and Birgit Kellner, 43-72. Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Satō Akira 佐藤晃.** 2012. "Kamalaśīla ikō no shugyō-ron ni okeru bodaishin no teigi ni kansuru ichikōsatsu: Toku ni hottshushin (prasthānaccita) no teigi o megutte" カマラシーラ以降の修行論における菩提心の定義に関する一考察: 特に発趣心 (prasthānaccita) の定義をめぐって. *Kuon* 久遠 3: 91-109.

(112) The *Pramāṇasamuccaya*'s Opening Reverence Invocation and Kamalaśīla's *Bodhicitta* (SATO)

Vetter, Tilmann. 1984. *Der Buddha und seine Lehre in Dharmakīrtis Pramāṇavārttika*. Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 12. Vienna: Arbeitskreis für Tibetologie und Buddhistische Studien Universität Wien.

**Key words** Kamalaśīla, Dharmakīrti, bodhicitta, karuṇā

(Researcher, Kyushu University, Ph.D.)

—— 新刊紹介 ——

Rolf Giebel 訳

THE MAHAYANA SUTRA OF PREVIOUS LIVES AND  
CONTEMPLATION OF THE MIND-GROUND  
(英訳『大乘本生心地観経』)

B5変形判, 272頁, 本体価格5,000円  
仏教伝道協会, 2021年8月